
This version is available at https://strathprints.strath.ac.uk/32868/

Strathprints is designed to allow users to access the research output of the University of Strathclyde. Unless otherwise explicitly stated on the manuscript, Copyright © and Moral Rights for the papers on this site are retained by the individual authors and/or other copyright owners. Please check the manuscript for details of any other licences that may have been applied. You may not engage in further distribution of the material for any profitmaking activities or any commercial gain. You may freely distribute both the url (https://strathprints.strath.ac.uk/) and the content of this paper for research or private study, educational, or not-for-profit purposes without prior permission or charge.

Any correspondence concerning this service should be sent to the Strathprints administrator: strathprints@strath.ac.uk
The emergence of digital services in Scottish public library websites

David McMenemy and Steven Buchanan
Department of Computer and Information Sciences
University of Strathclyde
david.mcmenemy@cis.strath.ac.uk
steven.buchanan@cis.strath.ac.uk

Research objectives
• A previous research project (Buchanan and McMenemy, 2010) investigating usability issues with PL websites found wide variation in digital services offered and associated terminology.
• This study further investigated PL digital services and in particular identification of major themes and trends.

Background
• Some public library websites compared to ‘digitised leaflets’ (Harden, 1998; McMenemy, 2007)
• Brinkley (2007): “many sites have grown in an unstructured and seemingly unplanned way, with services simply being added on as they become available”.
• A recent review of UK local authority websites by the Society of IT Managers (2010), incorporating PL websites, found that while overall visitor numbers to such websites increased by 22% in 2009, user satisfaction ratings dropped by 18%.
• How to present digital information “without confusion, duplication of effort and in a user friendly way” (Atherton, 2002).
Buchanan and McMenemy (2010) findings:

- Sample of 8 of 32 Scottish PL websites analysed to identify and compare range of services offered, extending to general usability observations.
- Key findings:
  - 202 discreet options (duplicates removed) identified across the 8 homepages. Minimum displayed 13, maximum 69.
  - A high incidence of ambiguous terminology (27%) and branded terms (20%) found.
  - Multiple organisation schemes utilised on all 8 homepages, with navigation found to be problematic.

Methodology

- Remote content analysis of all 32 Scottish public library websites conducted March-August 2010
- All options recorded, referenced and listed:
  - Options categorised according to Buchanan and McMenemy (2010) model.
  - Options further classified as:
    - Provided by or accessed via the public library.
    - Digital or non-digital service.

What is a digital service?

- No standard definition of a digital service exists, however we defined as: *information service or resource accessed and/or provided via digital medium*.
- What are the degrees of PL digital service?
  1. Information on information (e.g. existence)
  2. Direct access to digital content on PL website (PL as *content* provider).
  3. Indirect access to external digital content via PL website (PL as *access* provider).
- For the purposes of this study, we considered 1 is *not* a digital service.
Defining characteristics of a digital service

- Digital services can range from simple to more complex distributed and interactive systems, e.g.:
  - provision of online tools and virtual space for collaboration, sharing of content etc.,
  - online reference services,
  - more complex distributed and interactive systems such as digitised local archive collections linked to local school curriculums via virtual learning environments,
  - cross-institutional integrated digital collections.
Key usability observations

- Number of initial options on home pages ranged from 8 to 132 (average was 25).
- Rosenfeld and Morville (1998) argue that more than ten options can ‘overwhelm’ users.
- There was a high volume of ambiguous and branded terms.
- There was significant inconsistency in terminology evident, for example the following slide highlights the varied range of terms used for reference enquiry.
Library as content or access provider?

- Access provision was most prevalent in reference services, especially around subscription services.
- As a ratio, was also prevalent in health and wellbeing, and enterprise and employment.
- In the latter two categories provision of access to library evaluated websites was frequent.
- Library created content was often seen in topics related to provision of children's services, and genealogy and heritage.

Digital vs. non-digital service by category

- Again, digital reference services was the most frequent category in this area.
- In the area of community support, digital services related to community information were seen.
- External links to reading sites was seen in recreational reading area, similarly in health and wellbeing.

Library as digital service provider
Key findings and observations

- Access to digital libraries essential to social and economic mobility (Liu et al, 2006).
- However wide variance in categorisation of digital services is a significant usability issue for PL websites and a potential barrier to user satisfaction.
- Successfully delivering digital services necessitates high degree of collaborative working between PLs and partners (e.g. NHS, third sector, commercial).

Limitations

- Study limited in time/level of categorisation that could be applied.
- Presenting purely raw data for first time today, data will be filtered more closely for extended paper for publication in late 2011.
- Purpose of study is not to name/shame public libraries but to define patterns/trends in public library website provision and identify key issues for future development.
On-going further research at Strathclyde

- Development of an enhanced taxonomic structure providing a categorisation system and controlled vocabulary for digital services.
- Information seeking behaviour of different user groups will be examined to determine if public library websites satisfy needs.
- Investigating collaborative information architectures across multiple partners.

References