Boyle, Mark and Motherwell, Suzanne (2005) Attracting and retraining talent: lessons for Scottish policy makers from the experiences of scottish expatriates in Dublin. Project Report. Scottish Economic Policy Network, Glasgow, United Kingdom.

http://eprints.cdlr.strath.ac.uk/3114/

# ATTRACTING AND RETAINING TALENT: LESSONS FOR SCOTTISH POLICY MAKERS FROM THE EXPERIENCES OF SCOTTISH EXPATRIATES IN DUBLIN

Dr Mark Boyle and Suzanne Motherwell
Department of Geography and Sociology
University of Strathclyde

## Introduction

*'Seven months ago I said that Scotland, for both reasons of economic growth and social development, needed to address its predicted population decline and changing demographic profile. I argued that the best way to do this was not to try and affect natural changes in birth rates, but to attract people to live and work in Scotland: to retain talent within our borders, to attract ex-Scots back home – and attract new talents from all over the UK, Europe and further afield. I want to promote Scotland better abroad – as a place to both live and work. We already promote Scotland as a place to visit and a place to invest. Now I want to complete that circle by promoting our country as a place with a high quality of life and as a good place to live and work. Our cities must be at the centre of our efforts to attract new people to Scotland. A key challenge is for them to be cosmopolitan as well as metropolitan.'*

(Jack McConnell, Scotland's First Minister, 25/2/03 and 24/09/03)

In his first key economic speech in September 2002, First Minister Jack McConnell argued that increasing its pool of skilled labour by encouraging in-migration was of critical importance if Scotland was to foster economic growth (Insider, 2002). On this basis, McConnell launched *The Fresh Talent Scotland Initiative* on February 25th 2003, which has as its three central goals: a) improving the promotion of Scotland abroad as a place to live and work; b) working with the UK government to promote Scotland as a destination for people applying for UK work permits; and c) encouraging students to stay in Scotland after graduation. At a seminar on September 24th 2003 jointly organised by the Scottish Executive and CBI Scotland, McConnell demonstrated his commitment to this initiative by announcing the establishment of a new one-stop advisory unit to assist those who are interested in living and working in Scotland. This advisory unit will come on stream progressively throughout 2004.

With a view to contributing research of value to the *Fresh Talent Scotland Initiative*, this research project has been devised with specific reference to the first of the three goals noted above. Specifically, it is concerned with gaining insights into why talented individuals leave Scotland in the first instance, and thereafter to ascertain whether anything might be done to <u>both</u> stem the outflow <u>and</u> lure back to Scotland some of its most talented diasporeans. Such a goal in turn begets, it will be argued, greater insights into the actual experiences of contemporary diasporeans in the run up to migration and whilst in exile.  Using one emerging magnet for Scottish expatriates as a case study, the Republic of Ireland and more specifically Dublin, the project seeks to examine the embroilment of skilled Scottish expatriates in the so called Celtic Tiger phenomenon. The basic purpose of this report is to present insights into the decision making processes that have led migrants to leave Scotland and to move to Dublin, to gain an appreciation of what life has been like for expatriates living in Dublin and what Scotland might learn from these experiences, and finally to review future locational preferences with a view to establishing whether a return to Scotland may be a possibility.

Traditional explanations of patterns of skilled migration (Boyle, Halfacree, and Robinson 1999) have tended to follow the **human capital** school where the rise and fall of economies and the growth and decline in the fortunes of labour markets has been deemed to be key. More recently, researchers have attempted to augment this focus on hard, career oriented economic explanations with a focus upon the softer effects of **quality of life.** People's locational choices are affected by the standards of living afforded by places and this includes factors such as crime, health care, transport infrastructure, and housing. More recently again, great attention would seem to being paid to a fresh literature which is emphasising new dimensions of the soft-infrastructure that may be important.  Beyond 'social' quality of life issues lies the domain of 'cultural' quality of life issues that centre on the significance of the attractions of **cultural cosmopolitanism.** This three fold distinction between **human capital**, **quality of life** and **cultural cosmopolitanism** will be used herein to develop an analytic framework within which the experience of Dublin based Scottish expatriates might be better understood.

The report is structured around five sections. Section 2 will seek to explain in greater detail the contexts which have led to the launching of *The Fresh Talent Initiative*.  In section 3, the policy value of studying Scottish expatriates in Dublin in particular will be clarified. This section will end with a formal statement of the research questions that have informed the project. The remainder of the report will then discuss the findings of ten Focus Groups conducted with Scottish expatriates in Dublin in the summer of 2003. In section 4, the methodology through which the Focus Groups were undertaken will be discussed. In section 5, the principle themes to have emerged from the Focus Groups will then be examined. Finally, in section 6, a number of possible policy recommendations that flow from the work will be discussed.

## Why has attracting to and retaining talent in Scotland become so important?

The growth of skill shortages through time in any economy can be said to derive from one of three sources: a growth of that economy relative to the working age population; a decline of the working age population relative to the economy; or a growing mismatch in the skills inherent in the labour market relative to the skills required by the economy. A relatively poorly performing economy at the periphery of Europe, Scotland's current skill shortages cannot in truth be attributed to the success of its economy.  Instead, the Fresh Talent Initiative needs to be situated against growing policy interest in the role of the latter two forces; first and foremost the impacts of the absolute decline of the country's working age

population and secondly the nation's limited ability to serve as an incubator for members of what, following Richard Florida (2002a and b), will be referred to as the 'creative class'.

## Policy context 1 - Scotland's declining population structure and the growing problems of unmet replacement demand in the labour market.

The Scottish population is in decline and indeed Scotland occupies premier position in the European league table of shrinking populations (Randall, 2002). This decline in the absolute size of the population and by default the absolute size of the working age population is primarily responsible for the country's growing skill shortages. Historically, growth in the Scottish population through natural increase (fertility less mortality) has tended to be cancelled by net out-migration (emigration less immigration). What is interesting from recent trends however, is the progressive reversal of this trend through time such that in the past decade Scotland's shrinking population has derived more from natural decline than migration (Randall, 2002). Indeed, reversing the broad historical trend, Scotland has recently emerged as a small net importer of people, and it is in-migration that is now struggling to compensate for the country's falling birth rates. This pattern of stable or small net in migration is predicted to continue for the next decade.

The contribution of Scotland's demographic trends to emerging skill shortages then derives from the problem of falling birth rates and an ageing population structure and not from any brain drain as such. The consequences of the natural decline of Scotland's population on the labour market are starkly shown in Table 1a and Table 1b. As one would expect given the weakness of the Scottish economy, it is replacement demand (existing jobs that will need to be filled due to retirements), and not expansion demand (new jobs that will need to be filled as the economy grows), that presents the greatest challenge to the Scottish labour market. Among the key economic sectors that will require fresh talent by 2006 are Distribution, Hotel and Catering, Health and Education, Professional Services, Construction, Banking and Business Services, Engineering, Public Admin and Defence and 'Other Services' (Future Skills Scotland, 2002a; 2002b; 2003). The occupational categories that will be most sought after by 2006 will be Elementary Clerical/Services, Elementary Trade/Plant and Machine, Corporate Managers, Science and Technology specialists, Admin and Clerical staff, Culture, Media and Sports employees, and Health Professionals (Future Skills Scotland, 2002a; 2002b; 2003).

Of course, the problems of finding fresh pools of skilled labour to plug emerging gaps in the labour market does not lead automatically to a policy of promoting immigration. Possible options that have been attempted in other low birth populations include; promoting pro-natalist social and economic policies, retraining the unemployed, removing barriers to entry to the labour market and specifically encouraging greater female participation in the labour force, and increasing the age of retirement. With *The Fresh Talent Scotland Initiative* nonetheless, it is clear that the preferred option in Scotland's ruling Executive at present is retaining and attracting pools of skilled labour: encouraging in-migration to Scotland and securing a net brain gain is clearly being perceived as the key solution.

## Policy Context 2 - Growing interest in the role of the 'creative classes' in delivering a revived Scottish economy.

A second policy context that has stimulated great interest in Scottish policy circles recently relates to a growing interest in the need to prospect for a larger share of the so-called creative class (Scottish Enterprise 2003; Harrison and Mason 2003). Influenced greatly by Richard Florida's seminal text *The rise of the creative class* (Florida 2002a and b), there is a growing belief among policy analysts that related to but independent off the absolute shortage of skills that will derive from unmet replacement demand, is the shortage of pools of creative talent in the economy. According to this school of thought, even if Scotland could fill all its labour requirements at present, this would merely facilitate a reproduction of the economic status quo. The prosperity of the economy will require the injection of additional types of labour – members of the creative class – who will play a key role in re-invigorating innovation and technological development.

According to Florida, members of the creative class represent the brokers of successful, innovative, flexible, and dynamic regional economies. So called Post-Fordist cities or networked learning regions, or new industrial districts, simply cannot develop without them. The creative classes represent;

*'A fast growing, highly educated, and well paid segment of the workforce on whose efforts corporate profits and economic growth increasingly depend. Members of the creative class do a variety of work in a variety of industries – from technology to entertainment, journalism to finance, high-end manufacturing to arts. They do not consciously think of themselves as a class. Yet they share a common ethos that values creativity, individuality, difference and merit.'* Florida (2002b 3)

The creative class is comprised of a 'super creative core' which includes university lecturers, poets, actors, novelists, entertainers, architects and designers, cultural worthies, researchers, analysts and opinion formers. In addition to this super creative core there are other members of the class who work in high tech industries, in the legal and accounting profession, in marketing and business management and in health care. In the United States at present, Florida estimates that the creative class numbers around 38 million workers, with the super creative core consisting of nearly 15 million workers (Florida 2002a).

At the heart of Florida's analysis is the belief that if the creative class can make or break the fortunes of a regional economy, then a pre-requisite for success is the need to attract members of this class to one's nation, region or city. The preparation and re-engineering of workplaces and cities to suite the needs of the creative class becomes of vital importance. Given the core significance attached by the creative class to openness, tolerance, diversity, colour, festivity,

creativity and spontaneity, transforming conservative, bureaucratic and stifling (work) places to liberal, bohemian, multicultural and cosmopolitan ones emerges as the key policy prescription. Based upon a number of Indices variously titled the 'Creativity Index', the 'Gay Index', the Bohemian Index' and so on, Florida identifies cities like San Francisco, Austin, San Diego, Boston and Seattle as exemplars of the creative class' preferred habitat. In contrast, places like Memphis, Norfolk, Las Vegas, Buffalo, New Orleans and Oklahoma City stand as repellents to the creative class. In highlighting the importance of **cultural cosmopolitanism** as a key dynamic of migration patterns, Florida is clearly offering something new to literature on migration research that has hitherto worked with the ideas of **hard human capital** and softer social **quality of life** factors.

The reason why Florida's work sets a vital context against which the work of *Fresh Talent Scotland* needs to be understood relates to a widely held suspicion that to date, creative people have found Scotland to be stuffy, rule bound, parochial and conservative. For some time now, there would appear to have been a pervasive concern within Scotland concerning the low level of innovation, creativity, and innovation within the Scottish workforce. In her book, *The Scots' crises of confidence*, Craig (2003) points to the Scottish penchant for the 'put down'; the dominance of negativity and self criticism, the paralysing fear of being ruined by a business failure, and the making of virtue out of NOT standing out of the pack. Designed for comic effect but nevertheless underpinned by a serious point, a standard joke that circulates is that for Scottish people, a win-win situation is often when a colleague or neighbour loses out twice!

Whilst critiques of Scottish cultural fatalism and low levels of self confidence and entrepreneurialism often lack the kind of empirical evidence necessary to sustain a solid argument, the recent Global Entrepreneurship Monitor report (Levie et al. 2002) provides some important insights regarding Scotland's weak entrepreneurial culture. In 2002, Scotland was ranked 29th most entrepreneurial in a list of 37 (mostly) developed countries. This result ensured that Scotland accumulated only 85% of the overall UK entrepreneurship score. Moreover, although not statistically significant, new business activity rates declined by 10% between 2001 and 2002, a trend that was particularly marked by a reduction in young adult business start ups.

Against this backdrop, in a recent speech to pupils at Robert Gordon's College, one of Scotland's top expatriate businessmen, Don Cruickshank, caused something of a furore by offering the following advice to young Scots wishing to overcome the reputed handicaps of Scottish cultural life:

*'Get out of Scotland. It is parochial, self-centred, and riddled with the old-boy network...maybe we'd flourish a bit better, both economically and culturally, if more of you gained more experience of the rest of the world – and I'm definitely not talking about a gap year. I suspect the accumulated wealth and experience which at least some of you would bring back to Scotland might bring an openness, vigour, and freshness to Scottish life that would benefit everyone.'*
(Don Cruickshank, Chairman of the London Stock Exchange, *The Guardian,* September 21st 2002).

Whilst many would disagree with the severity of Cruickshank's damming indictment, in the light of the above observations presumably few would claim that Scotland would perform strongly on any of Florida's leagues tables of creativity and innovation. To the extent that Scottish people are held back by a series of cultural dispositions which suffocate rather than incubate talent and creativity, then a policy programme designed to learn lessons from other 'hotter cultures', and to lure a greater quota of the creative class to Scotland, might prove to be a vital component of future economic growth.

# Introduction to the research project

### Why study Scots in Dublin?

Set against the backdrop of the two key policy agendas identified above, this research project sets out to examine the experiences of Scottish expatriate labour currently enjoying the fruits of the Celtic Tiger. We define Scottish expatriates in this context as Scottish nationals who have spent more than a year living and working in the Irish Republic. We define the Celtic Tiger phenomenon to encompass the world beating and rapid economic growth of the Irish Republic since 1993. Given the overwhelming primacy of Dublin, we take Dublin to represent the engine room of Ireland's booming economy. Finally we define skilled migration more loosely to refer to flows of a variety of manual, service, technical, managerial and professional staff in what are often referred to as the Registrar General's socio-economic categories 1, 2, and 3 (non manual and manual).

Spurred on by world beating rates of economic growth since 1993 (Allen 2000, McSharry and White 2000, O'Hearn 2001, Clinch, Convery and Walsh, 2002). The Republic of Ireland in the past decade has witnessed a remarkable turnaround in its migration fortunes (Central Statistics Office 2002a and b). From being a source of one of the world's largest diaspora (around 70 million people worldwide claim to be of Irish descent), the Irish Republic has become a substantial net importer of people. Whilst in the period 1986-1991 annual net migration stood at –26,800, in the period 1996-2002 annual net migration registered +25,600. Combined with a still above replacement level of fertility, the Irish population then is displaying real signs of growth.

Albeit contributing to this wider influx of labour, the Scottish expatriate community in the Irish Republic is a relatively small one. Table 2 indicates that at the time of the last census conducted in the Irish Republic (April 28th 2002), nearly

16,000 Scots born people were officially recorded as being resident. Clearly, even if all 16,000 were to return to Scotland overnight, this particular diasporic community would not make a significant dent in Scotland's skill shortages. Why then, might research into the experiences of the Dublin based Scottish community merit particular attention? This project endorses growing calls for Scotland to learn lessons from the Celtic Tiger (Alexander 2003, Kirkpatrick 2003, Kurgman, 2003) and has been devised on the basis of the claim that whilst numerically small, the Scottish diaspora in Dublin is qualitatively important in so far as it yields insights of pertinence to the two key policy contexts identified above.

1.   Unlike other Scottish diaspora that arguably reached their zenith in the historical past, the flight of Scottish diasporeans to Ireland since 1993 has created a live and dynamic expatriate community. At a time when Scotland would seem to have stemmed the flight of its talent and reached stability in terms of net migration, Dublin remains one community that talented Scottish people are still choosing to relocate to. Moreover, anecdotal evidence would suggest that Dublin is attracting migrants in precisely those sectors that Scotland is witnessing a replacement demand deficit in. The Irish labour agency FAS (2003) reports that it has undertaken successful international recruitment initiatives particularly in the areas of IT, biotechnology and pharmaceuticals, financial services and banking, legal services and management consultancy, nursing, and hotel and catering. Whilst a lack of data mitigates against proving that Scottish in-flows are typical of all migrant streams into Dublin, it would seem a feasible assumption that many Scots have moved to Dublin to work in these expanding sectors of the economy. If *The Fresh Talent Scotland Initiative* is serious in its ambitions to lure back diasporeans in those sectors of the economy that have been most effected by natural decline, then the Dublin expatriate community would seem a productive constituency to generate insights into.

2.   This report will take seriously Wendy Alexander's (2003) recent suggestion that it is in the cultural underpinnings of Ireland's economic miracle that Scottish economic policy makers might learn the greatest lessons. For many, the attractiveness of Dublin to migrants derives not only from the economic opportunities furnished by its booming economy:  in Florida's terms it is Dublin's image as a dynamic, open, young, European, cosmopolitan party city that has been in part responsible (Travers 2001).  Whilst a happy coincidence of disjointed incremental measures, the unique and vibrant Dublin vibe is something the city itself is increasingly playing on. Millington and Young in looking at Dublin City Development Board's *Dublin – A city of possibilities strategy (2002-2012)* have pointed out how cosmopolitanism, cultural mixing, openness, tolerance and cultural inclusion have been promoted as core components of the city's future development. They conclude,

*' In Dublin, there is a strong notion of the city as a cosmopolitan space where local elites are promoting a cosmopolitan feel and outlook by attempting to manipulate the aesthetic profile, attitude and habitus of the city by creating new channels of movement and symbolic linkages within the city. The state is also attempting to redefine citizenship using notions of cosmopolitanism. This is defined in the discourse of being active in the civic realm, entrepreneurial, tolerant of multi-cultural identities and open to difference.'* (Millington and Young 2003 16)

Not only then does Dublin play host to a live and growing diasporic community comprised of labour with skills that are in particular demand in the Scottish economy, it would seem too to be an ideal test bed for the suspicion that Scotland is unable to retain and to attract back its members of the creative class who are increasingly finding the excitement of the cosmopolitan vibe elsewhere more seductive. If Dublin stands for one of the 'hotter cultures' that Scotland is keen to emulate, then it ought to hold some important lessons for Scottish policy makers.

## Statement of research objectives

Having set the study into context, it is now instructive to specify the precise research questions that informed the research. These questions can be organised under three headings:

**a - To seek to understand the reasons why an increasing number of Scots are choosing to live and work in the Celtic Tiger and in particular Dublin.**

How do migrants explain their reasons for moving to the Celtic Tiger? Were there any particular aspects to living and working in Scotland that did not appeal to them?   What 'hard' (economic), and 'soft' (social and cultural) factors drew them to the Celtic Tiger and to Dublin in particular? Was the cosmopolitan 'vibe' that Dublin managed to create in the 1990s a primary source of attraction for Scottish expatriates?

**b - To explore the experiences of Scottish expatriates in Dublin both at work and at play.**

*Creativity and the workplace*: What is the Scottish expatriate experience of the Dublin workplace? In what sense is this experience differentiated from expatriates' encounters with the Scottish workplace?  What lessons might Dublin hold for Scottish economic policy makers concerned about the effects of the organization and management of workers on the creativity of those workers?

*Creativity and the ambience of the city:* What is the Scottish expatriate experience of living in Dublin? How far do they feel it to be a richer and more cosmopolitan lifestyle than that available in Scotland?  What lessons might the managers of Scottish cities learn from Dublin vis a vis producing a cosmopolitan vibe? Taking the sentiments of Jack McConnell

seriously, that Scottish cities need to be cosmopolitan as well as metropolitan, can Scotland learn anything from Dublin's repositioning in the global cultural map?

**c - To gain insight into the aspirations of expatriates, whether a return to Scotland is on their minds, and under what circumstances such a return might take place**

In the light of the slower rates of economic growth the Celtic Tiger has experienced since 2002, and in particular the slow down in employment and wage growth relative to prices, what scope is there for a return of the expatriate community to Scotland, armed with their new skills, to help plug skill shortages in the Scottish economy? What factors might sway the location decisions of the skilled expatriates? If they plan to stay in Dublin or to move on to a third country, what are their views on an eventual return to Scotland? To what extent do images of a dour, conservative, and insulated Scotland enter diasporeans minds, and if they do, how important are these images in shaping future locational decisions?

# Methodology

Given that the basic purpose of this research was to gain insights into the experiences of the Scottish diaspora in Dublin, it was decided from the outset that only qualitative research methods would be appropriate. In light of the nature of the subject matter and the desire to probe a broad range of experiences, it was decided that the Focus Group method in particular offered the most promising route. Given the scope of research that was possible, the initial intention was to conduct 10 Focus Groups consisting of 5 expatriates in Dublin. Consistent with the claim that certain key sectors of the Scottish economy (where skill shortages were perceived to be greatest) looked set to suffer skill shortages in the near future, the aim was to undertake groups on a sectoral basis. In the end, 10 groups were completed in the summer of 2003. However, due to participant recruitment difficulties only 38 expatriates eventually took part; resulting in an average of 3.8 expatriates per group. Moreover, recruitment difficulties meant that it became impossible to undertake sector specific groups so many of the groups incorporated a mix of different kinds of employee. The purpose of this section is to outline the methodology that was eventually implemented. Attention will be given to the process of recruiting participants, details of the characteristics of the 38 expatriates who took part, and information about the groups which were undertaken and the interview schedule that was used.

One of the greatest challenges concerning the organisation of one off focus groups is the recruitment of willing participants. This is especially problematic when potential participants are based in another country, placing added pressure on the logistics of the project. In spite of the fact that a fee of 50 Euro per head was offered, generating suitable participants proved to be such a formidable challenge that the planned research design had to be compromised. The following methods of recruitment were used generating variable success rates;

- Face-to-face distribution of information to companies based in central Dublin - 15 participants recruited.
- Using Scottish databases of expatriates (ICAS, Talent Scotland, Strathclyde University Alumni) - 11 participants recruited.
- Contacting people through friends and colleagues based in Scotland and in Dublin – 7 participants recruited.
- Contacting 211 Human Resource Departments of companies based in Ireland within each target sector (via email, letter or telephone) – 5 participants recruited.
- Contacting all Heads of Departments, secretaries and student bodies in universities and colleges in Dublin – 0 participants recruited.
- Distribution of advertisement on all Aer Lingus Flights from Glasgow Airport to Dublin on the week commencing June 9th 2003. 0 participants recruited.

In the end, 10 groups were eventually completed between May 6th 2003 and August 21st 2003 (Appendix 1).

Following three unsuccessful attempts to undertake groups (one complete no show and two sessions with only two attendees), it was decided that it was not cost effective to persist with the initial research design. Once participants had expressed an interest in taking part, the groups were organised immediately irrespective of sector. Even after the decision was taken to relax the sector by sector approach, a number of no shows meant that some groups had to be undertaken with a less than ideal number of participants. Over recruitment for focus groups is essential and despite exhaustive measures to ensure this, it was not always possible. Even committed participants did not always attend either for personal or on most occasions work related emergencies. Towards the end of the field season then, groups went ahead regardless of the number of participants who attended, as the time and financial constraints of the project restricted the possibility of reconvening.

Each of the 38 participants was asked at the end of their respective groups to complete a short questionnaire so that the broad characteristics of the entire cast could be ascertained.
An overview of the participants is provided in Table 3 and in more detail, in Appendix 2. Among the key features of the cohort to keep in mind when interpreting the Focus Group findings are the following;

- Young adults emerged as the dominant stream (nearly 90 % are between the ages of 18 and 35). This would appear to be consistent with the age profile of all migrants to Dublin and is an endorsement of Dublin's image as a youthful city (Central Statistics Office 2002b).
- The majority of the participants were not in committed relationships and were relatively footloose in regards to personal ties (nearly three quarters are single).
- Three quarters of participants were men. Given that it is known that in-migration to Dublin in the past decade has involved an equal proportion of men and women (Central Statistics Office, 2002b), this suggests that either the Scottish influx is unrepresentative, or more likely males were more likely to respond to the Focus Group invite.
- The vast majority of participants had migrated to Dublin very recently with nearly 90% arriving from 1998 onwards. The Scottish diasporic community in Dublin is a relatively fresh one.
- Less than a quarter of migrants had bought property in Dublin, highlighting both the transience of the migration and the cost of housing in Dublin.
- Participants hailed from a wide range of geographical origins in Scotland and the West of Scotland was not the only source of migrants.
- Perhaps surprisingly, only a minority had Irish ancestry, indicating that this is not a phenomenon driven primarily by historical family connections with Ireland.
- Finally although participants span a wide range of occupational and salary scales, nearly two thirds came from the Accountancy and Finance, ICT, and Hotel and Catering sectors. These of course, are sectors with key skill shortages in Scotland.

The purpose of the Chair in each case was to introduce the background to the research project and to explain the structure of the themes that were to be covered. Depending on the liveliness and course of the discussion, the Chair occasionally had to intervene to steer discussion away from irrelevant issues and to prompt further debate by asking probing questions. Given that the analysis section to follow cannot hope to cover all the material collected, it was thought useful to include here (Appendix 3) the prompt card that was used. It should be noted that not all groups covered all the points noted and indeed groups often took discussion off onto other unexpected but stimulating issues. Finally, all the participants were aware that the discussion would be taped prior to attending the group. This is extremely important, as trying to take notes for a group discussion is practically impossible. Once each of the groups had been completed the tapes were fully transcribed. The result was a massive database consisting of around 92,000 words and it is this database that the remainder of this paper reports on.

# Results of the focus groups

In the introduction, various traditions of migration research were identified. Focussing upon the most fundamental triggers of particular migrant streams, three broad schools of thought were recognised; the **human capital,** social **quality of life**, and **cultural cosmopolitan** approaches. In this section, an effort will be made to assess the pertinence of each of these approaches to the understanding of the Scottish expatriate community in Dublin. Whilst the conclusions reached require an appreciation of important nuances and subtleties, the broad argument which will be advanced herein is that all three approaches have different degrees of relevance depending upon the stage at which expatriates are examined; with the human capital approach seeming to be the overwhelming explanation of the initial decision to move, the cultural cosmopolitan approach helping to explain the professional and personal pleasures of Dublin that helps expatriates to settle in once in situ, and the social quality of life approach playing a growing role in shaping migrants decisions about their capacity to remain in Dublin indefinitely. This we contend carries crucial implications when framing possible policy responses.

**Research question 1 - To seek to understand the reasons why an increasing number of Scots are choosing to live and work in the Celtic Tiger and in particular Dublin.**

Recent literature on skilled international migration has pointed to the relative decline of permanent migration and the rise to prominence of transient or temporary displacement (Findlay, 2002). A growing cohort of migrants it would seem, require to be mobile whilst developing their careers, sampling a variety of different company hierarchies, cultures and work practices. Often but not always, this migration is channelled inside the labour markets of trans-national corporations with mobility a pre-requisite to rising up the company ladder and eventually assuming a position of responsibility back at headquarters. A definitive feature of the Scottish expatriate community in Dublin is the foot-looseness of migrants. Throughout the Focus Groups, there was a constant trivialisation of the decision to migrate. This casualisation of what still is an international relocation decision after all, was most manifest when participants talked about the almost accidental and happenstance circumstances that surrounded their decision to migrate, and when they proffered the belief that it would not be a problem to reverse the decision were they to feel unhappy in Dublin. Clearly the relative youth and lack of ties of the Focus Groups cohort allied to the close proximity of Dublin to Scotland (repeatedly mentioned in relation to the growth of low cost airlines), goes some way to explaining this liberated attitude to displacement.

In spite of qualifying for the label of skilled transient migrant, none of the participants were channelled into Dublin through the labour markets of companies that had offices in the city. In examining the routes that took Scots to Dublin, it is useful to identify two alternative types of movement; what will be referred to here as the 'tumbleweed' and the 'career opportunities' varieties. The importance of Dublin's appeal as a young, 'happening' cosmopolitan European city

in the decision to move varies between both groups. A central argument of this section nevertheless, is that the buoyancy of the labour market is the supreme factor in both cases.

### The Tumbleweeds

The tumbleweeds represent expatriates who would appear to be very footloose and open to being 'blown about' by factors only partially shaped by career ambitions. Three particular types of tumbleweed were most conspicuous in the Focus Groups. First, at the lower end of the labour market, tumbleweeds were workers in the service sector (for instance hotel and catering) who had simply grown bored with life in Scotland and who had heard about the 'buzz' and 'vibe' of Dublin and had casually decided to give it a go. Second, further up the scale were recent graduates who wanted to 'live a little' before settling down into a life of responsibility and who thought of Dublin as the perfect party city to exorcise their adolescent rites of passage. Finally, and invariable offering skills at the higher end of the labour market were the seasoned travellers who had perhaps already tasted travel around the world and for whom Dublin was on the world map as an exciting place to work for a few years. Whilst the tumbleweeds come closest to affirming the importance of Florida's (2002a) claim about the central importance of cultural pluralism and the atmosphere of a place, it is important to note that in all cases, tumbleweeds pointed out that were it not for the ready availability of appropriate employment opportunities Dublin, for all its lifestyle attractiveness, would not have figured as a serious potential destination.

---

Tumbleweeds and the pleasures of Dublin

*'I just fancied a change. I had heard a lot about Dublin and I had been in Australia travelling and decided to try Dublin. I had met a couple of Irish folk in Australia and it sounded really good.'*

*'I'd been here for a weekend and enjoyed it. So I just came over, booked myself into a B and B on Grafton St and walked up and down O'Connell St and Grafton St trying to get work in pubs and I got started in Fraziers straight away. I done it pretty quickly. It was just one Thursday morning and I was in bed and I thought, I'm getting out of here I packed in my job on the Friday and I was over here on the Tuesday. You know it just clicked; I don't like it here any more and I need to get away.'*

*'I first came over for the Ireland/Scotland Rugby friendly which was at the end of May 2000 and at the time my brother's best mate was going to be here. So after about a month I moved across. I went home and chucked in my job and just came over. I had a good job back home but the opportunities over here were amazing so I just chanced it. Plus the nightlife is great. You feel more comfortable in pubs.'*

*'Dublin seemed to have a real buzz about it you know. I had been over before for a couple of weekends and had a really cracking time. As a place to drink it is fantastic. It's a great place to go out and meet people – people from all over the world - and have some real fun. I had been to Dublin a couple of times before and it was party city. The Irish are really friendly you know much more open and willing to talk to anyone, especially the Scots, I think because we have the same sort of humour you know. Even at work you know we are always going out, not just at the weekends but during the week too. It is part of life here. Drinking and having a good time.'*

*'For me it was also getting involved in a new hotel as well but I had heard so much about Dublin as a city too. It was a great place to go and the people were really friendly. It seemed to be one of the cities in Europe that was up and coming and people wanted to go and live and visit there. So that was the big attraction. It has always been renowned as being one of those cities where people go for stag parties and hen nights.'*

---

### Career opportunities

Whilst the tumbleweeds represent an important constituency, by far and away the most pervasive explanation offered for migration related to Dublin's outstanding career opportunities. Advocates of this viewpoint most often began by noting the Dublin offered a way out for Scots suffering the ignominy of struggling to find careers and salaries appropriate to their education and skill levels back in Scotland. For many, the lack of career opportunities in Scotland was leading to a frustration that was making migration inevitable. Time and again, participants would then point to their disbelief with the ease with which they could pick up work in Dublin. This disbelief was extended to include not only the ubiquity of employment per se, but the comparative superiority of careers available in the city. The possibility of working for large multi-national companies with no presence in Scotland, the potential to undertake higher level functions, the enhanced possibility of accelerated promotion and the capacity to assume unprecedented responsibility for one's age were all definitive themes.

An interesting feature of the surfeit of employment in Dublin has been the mushrooming of an army of recruiters making a living out of luring skilled labour to the city to fill unmet expansion demand. Indeed, this army would appear to be so pro-active that they managed to dislodge one participant from a settled life back in Scotland who had no intention of migrating to Dublin prior to being lobbied. Among the range of channels through which Scots were funnelled into Dublin were FAS (the state run manpower services commission), Recruitment Agencies, Executive Selection companies, Executive Search companies, trade fairs by large companies in Scotland, placing adverts in the Scottish press, soliciting records of company employees, and using internet recruitment. Arguably, it is in the aggression, innovation, and penetration of these methodologies of recruitment into foreign labour markets that Scotland can learn the most important lessons from the Celtic Tiger.

Dublin – The land of opportunities

' I had lived in Australia for three years, my husband is Australian and I was always going to come back to Scotland and when we got there, there were just no jobs and particularly in our area, Ayrshire, it was really difficult to find work. So we moved over here but we had considered going to Edinburgh or Glasgow but even the jobs there, there was nothing happening. We came over here and within a week we had a job. So that was why we ended up here.'

'It is quite simple really. I did my Masters in IT at University and I wouldn't say I couldn't get a job in Scotland but it was difficult; like to think of my contemporaries and all that they got jobs in the end but the West of Scotland being the West of Scotland, it takes a wee while. In Scotland there is so many graduates and without experience it is pretty difficulty. Specifically, I work for a German software company and they came to Glasgow on a recruitment campaign and they got 5 of us. That was in February 2001. I've been here for a couple of years now and it was basically for employment opportunities.'

'I think the main reason I came over was because there was no work at home. People were getting degrees and honours degrees but still couldn't get any work, but here you can come over with a basic education you know Highers and whatever and get snapped up as they're desperate for workers here. There is no point in studying hard in Scotland and working hard in Scotland and by the time you finish your education you are struggling to get a job, and when you do get a job you're not really getting enough to live, or you are just scrapping by so that its not really worth putting yourself through all the hard work to stay in a place and not benefit from it.'

'I graduated three years ago and at the time I didn't actually look for a job in Scotland, cause the perception was that there was nothing, it was booming over here. I thought there were more options over here for me. One of my tutors had actually worked in Dublin and said to the whole class that you are going to have a lot more opportunities in Ireland than you have here. That kind of put the idea into my head'

'I came out of University and eh had a few job interviews in England, IBM and stuff like that. I went to Birmingham and it's like a cattle market roughly three hundred people go and it was just a nightmare. I sent one e-mail to Bond Recruitment in Dublin, within half an hour the guy got back to me and said he worked for a large IT company in Dublin. I said, you cannot have read my CV; it's only been half an hour. Within 2 weeks he got me an interview. It was chalk and cheese (between England and Dublin) and I had been looking for about three or four months for a job. The recruitment companies here are totally different from the ones in Scotland. The ones in Scotland you go in and you give them your CV and they just say thanks. And you know its going straight in the bin once you are out the door. Here it was lock the door, this guy has got experience in IT, they were so desperate for anybody. It was a real culture shock, to come over here and actually the ball was on your side of the court. Real bonus coming over here and feeling wanted. Instead of chasing jobs, jobs were chasing you.'

'Actually I didn't want a job over here. I was quite happy working away in Glasgow. Then I got a phone call from an agency one day asking if I had heard of the company. And apparently they were quite well known, they had knocked Scottish Newcastle out of the FTSE 100 and all that sort of stuff. I said I don't
fancy it but I went across for a free weekend. They offered me the job and I was saying what am I doing, why am I leaving my friends and family. I didn't want it but they had offered 8 people it before.
They couldn't get somebody.'

'When I arrived here the economy was booming and they were desperate for people and I've got the opportunity to work in areas and assume responsibilities you wouldn't get elsewhere because they were desperate to get people in. Basically, they would give you work opportunities you would never get in Scotland because they were so short staffed. These opportunities were fantastic, and if I was moving elsewhere I would be able to list the things I did.'

'It's just easier to get into better roles. I mean, they are just looking for so many diverse things so it is easier to get a better role and you feel that once you've got that I should be able to move up the ladder You would like to think that if you moved back to Scotland you would slot into the same place but I very much doubt that and I think even getting really good experience here you would still be knocked down a peg or two back in Scotland because the opportunities are not the same.'

'There has been a brain drain in Scotland as all the jobs Scotland could offer involve working in call centres for £10 or £11 an hour. There is a whole wide world out there and call centres were all that were on your doorstep. I think we've got to the position of saying we don't have to accept that so we'll go somewhere else. But perhaps we would have liked to have stayed at home. But not under these conditions.'

**Research question 2 - To explore the experiences of Scottish expatriates in Dublin both at work and at play**

If the human capital school of thought best explains the *formation* of a new Scottish expatriate community in Dublin, it is equally fair to say that *once in Dublin*, Florida's ideas about the importance of cultural hybridity, tolerance, creativity, festivity, and cosmopolitanism, become more central issues. More so than career development, expatriates spoke at length in Focus Groups about their engagement with Dublin's cultural ambience both at work and in their everyday lives. In this section, attention will be devoted to expatriate views on Dublin as a place where creative talent can flourish. This discussion will be set against the backdrop of Wendy Alexander's (2003) assertion that Scotland might do well to

learn 'cultural' lessons from the Celtic Tiger as a prelude to learning economic lessons. Attention then will be given to the lessons that Scottish economic policy makers and urban managers might learn from Dublin's successful repositioning in the global cultural map. As promised above, attention will focus upon two themes, *creativity and the workplace* and *creativity and the ambience of the city*.

**Workplaces that offer the freedom to breath and to become**

In their recent survey of Scottish entrepreneurs, Price Waterhouse Coopers (2003) note the importance of the workplace as a site where creativity can be spotted, nurtured, incubated, and brought to full fruition in the interests of the company. Key to this is the construction of internal organisational and managerial systems that recognise employees as full human beings with dignity, and which serve to motivate and foster entrepreneurial skills rather than damage and suffocate these precious assets. At the root of this approach seems to be the creation of systems of corporate governance which are less hierarchical and more 'flat', and which give the employee a greater sense of empowerment and ownership over their working conditions and outputs.

A fascinating result to derive from the Focus Groups was the widespread comparisons that were drawn between working life in Scotland and working life in Dublin. Indeed, this point was raised in all ten focus groups and was the most discussed issue in the majority of the groups. For at least this small survey cohort, the results would seem to confirm the suspicion that Scottish workplaces are failing to cultivate conditions that are maximising the creative potential of their employees. Scottish businesses were characterised as being hierarchical, bureaucratic, unfriendly, rigid with time keeping and routes to promotion, conservative and stifling. For many people, this atmosphere was experienced as de-motivating, unprofessional, and suffocating. In comparison, Irish businesses were universally acclaimed as being more relaxed, friendly, less intimidating, more professional, more trusting of their employees, more flexible, and in general more supporting of the flourishing of the creativity of the employee.

It is clear that for these participants at any rate, Dublin would seem to be more advanced in transforming hierarchical systems of governance into flatter ones. Among the key features of working life in Dublin that appealed to participants were the following;

- Flexible working hours.
- Greater trust over timekeeping during the day.
- A greater feeling that one's ideas are being listened too.
- A greater confidence that one is getting recognised for one's ideas and that these ideas are not being appropriated by higher level management.
- A blurring of the boundaries between social and work relationships both within and between different levels of management.
- Irreverence for petty red tape.
- A more relaxed attitude to work attire.
- Promotion based upon talent and not time served.
- Greater emphasis upon more lateral approaches to problem solving.
- The fostering of a more 'human' and 'fun', as opposed to 'mechanical' and 'efficient', office ambience.
- An architectural design of the work place that is less hierarchical and more geared to team building.

---

Dublin : breath of fresh air in the workplace

*'What is really obvious is the difference in attitude to work. I find that Scottish people tend to problematise everything. It's a real negative trait that we go around making problems that don't exist. I really noticed that when I worked here for a year and then went back briefly to Scotland. It was like chalk and cheese. Even meeting politicians or project leaders, and various people from the community is different. Here everyone is on first name terms. And you can have lots of informal chats about issues and you know you are getting into someone's ear. In Scotland, I found the structure and the bureaucratic hoops that you have to go through stifling.'*

*'I feel it is a lot more creative and a more professional way to work as you are not sitting in the same position for years waiting to do your time to get a promotion. Here if they like you and your personality you can do well. I mean, I was interviewing people for a position recently and we were really looking for the personality that could fit within the team, not how many degrees they had.'*

*'I love working with the people. They are the biggest rogues and cheats you will meet anywhere! They are very easy going. I've never heard anybody lose their temper. There is less structure and people are less up their backsides than they are in Scotland. My company, you go out on the drink with the Chief Executive. It's a very relaxed approach to business.'*

*'I had come from working with British guys which was a nightmare as you always had someone on your back. You walk in twenty seconds late and everybody was looking at their watches and you were taken up to be disciplined. At this company, you come in when you want and you leave when you want, as long as you are doing your job and doing it well. You feel more like an employee than a prisoner. You are trusted. It is more professional I feel in comparison to my job in Scotland.'*

*'The Irish are very easy going. When I first started I was expecting people to shout and lose their head. But everybody is telling you to relax and the problem will be solved. I've never heard anybody shouting – although it's relaxed, its professional. I think a*

---

*lot of it is the Irish way as opposed to our Calvinist background, you know they are very easy going and they will talk about the problem rather than confront things head on. The first couple of times they were actually telling me to calm down. I think in Scotland it would have been a bit different.'*

*'I find that the Irish don't like structure too much. Whereas because of our background, our severe ways - sack cloth and all that, (ha ha) we like structure, you kind of like to see a bit of organisation to things. Most of the senior people in our organisation are disastrous when it comes to organising – I've never known a meeting to start on time. They just cannot do it. It's not in the Irish blood. They just do not like it.'*

*'It is definitely more laid back. I work in a software company and there are no time cards for clocking in. Official hours are 9-6 and the core hours are 10-4. I've never had any sort of hassle in the short time I've been over here. This is my work's clothes (points to his casual attire). Occasionally I will have to wear a shirt and tie. In Scotland, well it's been over 5 years now, I've always had to wear a suite shirt and tie.'*

*'When I was working in Scotland, it got to the stage where they were timing cigarette breaks and timing your tea breaks. I don't really thrive if someone is breathing down my neck – I like to work at my own pace, I find it more relaxing and it definitely encourages me to work more. Someone breathing down your neck, its puts you under pressure and you cannot concentrate properly.'*

*'I've been promoted twice in the last 16 months and you know I just don't think the same kind of opportunities are available back in Edinburgh. I don't know whether it is a kind of American Irish thing, where it is you know, work hard, play hard, drink hard, and then you get promoted, whereas in Edinburgh it still seems to be a slightly more dour existence. You know you have to prove yourself and you have to be in this position for two years and I know this is making sweeping generalisations but I have friends in similar positions in Edinburgh and it just seems that they have a certain amount of hoops to go through whereas certainly the big Irish American links mean you seem able to scoot round a few hoops if you show the same kind of attitude they are looking for.'*

*'When I worked for a law firm in Edinburgh, I always felt that somebody was watching you leave and you leaving the desk for ten minutes was punishable by death, being thrown out of the window! I've certainly benefited from being a lot more open in working here, and therefore it kind of produced a little more creativity in my working environment because I feel its going to be rewarded. You know they say if you have any ideas, if you feel you can change things, please tells us. And it's actually taken up not stolen or told you are too far down the ladder to do anything or suggest that. Rather it is embraced and taken up and it just makes your whole work worthwhile.'*

For many participants, the result of Irish working practices was a more playful, innovative, satisfied and motivated workforce. It would be misleading, however, to accept uncritically the Irish way and to ignore the voice of those Scots who were finding it difficult to square their outlook on work with that of the Irish. Whilst most participants argued that freedom brought with it a sense of responsibility and greater efficiency and productivity, some saw in the Irish only a lax attitude that was breeding laziness and inefficiency, and which was providing a frustrating climate to work in and to get results by a certain timetable. Indeed, interestingly many Scots felt that the balance they brought to the table – a mixture of Scottish application with Irish flexibility – was the key to the success they were experiencing in Dublin.

The frustrations of Irish working practices

*'For me it is more laid back, but there are two sides to it. To contrast it with the UK, there is a lack of stupid rules and look as if you're busy when you are not - the nonsense like that. They lack the kind of bosses who have been there for 30 years and you know have to justify their existence. At times though, it is frustrating, as you want to get things done. I find the attitude is that if something can be left 'til tomorrow to get done it will be left until tomorrow. There doesn't seem to be any sense of urgency to get things done. When you are doing your work then its great but when the bus driver doesn't turn up because they can't be bothered, that is the flip side.'*

*'I think personally the staff from abroad are more productive than Irish staff. They get more done. A girl cleaning hotel rooms for me will do 14 a day whereas with Irish staff you might only get 9 or 10 done. Irish staff are more problematic to work with, far more prone to sickness and not coming into work and they create far more general disciplinary problems. The foreign staff are more appreciative of the job and more appreciative of how well paid a lot of them are. There is also less training involved. We bring in staff from the Philippines and Pakistan and people say how do you train these staff up? The level of service is phenomenal. They are very service driven and know how to look after people.'*

*'The Irish suppliers are horrendous. The amount of phone calls you have to make, the amount of chasing you have to do. At times I had to make a decision that it was quicker to get my supplies from Scotland and to transfer it from Scotland to Ireland was quicker. It got to the stage where I was hitting my head against the brick walls. They can't be like this? Why can't they move onto the next stage and become efficient? It was made frustrating because of their personality. They would be very nice and pleasant and laid back - they're very nice people - but they just could not provide the service you were needing.'*

*'If you are on the phone to try to find something out you are given the run around the whole way. I do notice a difference there. But maybe it's just because of my job back home, the one I was in before I came. You would be sacked on the spot if I'd been like that. Maybe the place I used to work in was quite strict but...'*

**Cosmopolitanism in everyday life in the city**

According to Florida, the creative classes flourish not only in working environments that offer space to breathe but also in cities that are invested with a cosmopolitan, tolerant, open and bohemian feel. It was noted above that in his efforts to pitch the country to mobile members of the creative class First Minister Jack McConnell has recognised the need for Scottish cities to become cosmopolitan as well as metropolitan. At one level, the promotion of an anti-sectarian and anti-racist agenda, including the launching of the One Scotland/Many cultures initiative will need to play an integral role if this transition is to be realised. At another level, the integration of a multi-cultural and social inclusion agenda as part of the implementation of the Scottish Executive's wider *Cities Review* looks set also to be of critical significance.

Given the surge in both skilled and unskilled migrants from all over the world to Dublin since 1993, it would seem to be a city in which the pleasures of multi-culturalism and cultural hybridisation and pluralism are at the forefront. Not surprisingly then, expatriates' experience of Dublin's multi-culturalism formed a key theme in the Focus Groups. And yet, prior to 1993, Dublin might have been thought of as further off the cultural map than the provincial cities in Scotland. The purpose of this section is to examine how Scottish expatriates have experienced Dublin's rich mix of cultures with a view to drawing out lessons for Scotland itself. Can Scotland learn anything from Dublin in relation to its capacity to generate the kind of civic ambience that talented people would seem to prefer to live in?

A key feature of the Scottish diaspora in Dublin is the complete lack of a coherent and well-organized expatriate community. The Scots have dissolved into Dublin and beyond meeting socially for rugby matches, matches involving the old firm, or St Andrew's festivities and Burns nights, few see it as important that they mix and remain in contact with fellow Scots. Of course, diasporic communities most often tend to form in hostile environments as a psychological buffer assisting settlement. That Dublin is experienced as a very hospitable place for Scots was cited as the primary reason for the absence of a diasporic community.
Consequently, our opening conclusion was that Dublin was succeeding as a cosmopolitan capital, with Scots feeling insiders rather than outsiders, at home rather than as alien workers. Our interest was in how Dublin had managed to engender such a level of hospitality.

The fact that Dublin plays host to nationalities from all over the world does stand as a definite attraction to Scottish expatriates. Dublin is perceived to be a cosmopolitan vortex and a party city, full of colour and an exciting place to be. Experiencing other nations' ways of life, including their language, religions, customs and festivities, food, dress sense, and folklore was recognised to be a stimulant. Importantly however, in probing this sense of excitement further, the shallowness of Dublin's mixture of nationalities comes to the forefront. Dublin's is a *manicured cosmopolitanism* for Scottish people. Other cultures are sampled, not fundamentally engaged with. This sampling takes the form of 'partying' with others and is largely non-political – clearly a fundamental component of true or pure cosmopolitanism (Beck, 2002). Moreover, Scots are selective about who they chose to be cosmopolitan with! Poorer migrants from Africa, China, and Romania for instance, are recognised as lying out with the social circle, whilst Americans, Australians, New Zealanders and South Africans, and to a lesser extent other Europeans represent core groups for mixing with. Dublin presents a certain species of cosmopolitanism and it is a formula that Scots find enriching however shallow it might be.

---

The pleasures of sampling manicured cosmopolitanism

*'Dublin is one of the youngest cities in Europe and it also has a really cosmopolitan make up. Not only are there Europeans but there are Australians, East Europeans and so on. It's just so different to Kilmarnock and even Glasgow. There seems to be more excitement about Dublin because of its make up.'*

*'Dublin is a young city. Like, at home, none of the places are that big, Livingston, Edinburgh and even Glasgow, they're not that big really. If you went out every weekend with a group of friends you'd bump into the same people and you'd be in the same pubs and everyone would know everyone and there would be nothing exciting. I mean here you could go a million places and they'd be different people every weekend.'*

*'Dublin is a very cosmopolitan city. It has a very young population with a lot of disposable income. Most people I know in Scotland in the 20 to 30 age group are married with a house and kids and brand new car. Whereas here, at 30 years old, people are still not interested in that kind of lifestyle. The lifestyle revolves around the social life and going out. The bulk of people's money is spent on drink, buying clothes and going out to restaurants.'*

*'Dublin is so cosmopolitan its untrue, here they drink every night, like during the week, it doesn't matter what night you go out. Whereas back home, you could be the only person in the pub. It's a really open city – you go out and you might never bump into an Irish person, its all Australians, Zimbabweans, New Zealanders and so on, and it's brilliant bumping into people from a wide variety of backgrounds. It's a lot more open than Scotland and people go out and socialise more. I also find that commercially, working in a hotel environment, Dublin is very international I would say of the 100-120 employees we have not even 25% of them would be Irish. I think it is a kind of condensed version of London, it adds to your whole feeling of having diversity.'*

---

If Scottish people are engaging only with a very superficial species of cosmopolitanism, then it might be expected that the novelty value of living amidst a diversity of cultures might be expected to have a short lifespan. It would be wrong however, to think that Scottish people's social networks existed only at the level of a kind of cosmopolitan veneer that sits afloat the nitty gritty of the rest of the city. On further probing, it became apparent that a deeper reason why Scots felt so

at home in Dublin existed. At its core, this reason points to the penetration of Scots into domestic Irish social networks. The Irish, it seemed, were going out of their way to make Scottish people feel at home. The Irish hospitality to the Scots was variously attributed to the shared Celtic culture and political history of the two nations, the long history of migration between Scotland and Ireland, similar cultural attitudes, senses of humour, interest in language and social playfulness. The Scots it would seem feel very at ease in Dublin and this has certainly been crucial to their experience of the relocation as being a relatively happy and fulfilling one.

---

Home From home : The Scots in Dublin

*'I think you are accepted here whether you are good or bad at your job just because of the accent! I think there is a mutual appreciation society going on – I find that the Irish people don't view us as foreigners coming into their country, whereas we really are. We are just the same as Spanish people coming in or French. I don't think Irish people view us differently from themselves; maybe it's to do with the Celtic roots.'*

*'Your accent definitely helps you over here; it pushes you on a bit. I can remember the interview I got when I first came here. I opened my mouth and the guy said – oh, you're from Scotland, where abouts... and it breaks the ice. They say, ahh you're a nice wee Scottish lassie, c'mon I'll take you under my wings. I play up to it of course and have got several pay rises out of it!'*

*'I certainly think that the Irish way of looking at things – its very similar to the Scots – we're virtually kin. You know their social attitudes – there's no place for thinking you're something and you get cut down to size quickly if you try to play up. And of course the attitude to drinking and partying is – well it would not be out of place in Glasgow on a Friday night. There are definitely Celtic roots there that make you feel at home in Dublin. It's certainly not an alien kind of place for me.'*

*'It's quite funny really. I recently had lunch with a client and he said he had experienced a break-in from a foreigner and he said why can these foreigners not go back home to their own countries and I said to him I'll go home then. But he was basically saying ah but you Scottish, you're ok, you are nearly an Irishman.'*

*'I think the Gaelic attitude is dead similar in Scottish and Welsh and Irish people. I think they are all on the same wavelength, which is literally work hard, play hard. There seems to be quite an integration of nationalities, two different people but part of the same race.'*

*'I don't feel obliged to speak to a Scotsman. When I first came here I did, and maybe in the pub when there was a Celtic Vs Rangers football match and there was maybe a couple of people at the bar you would feel obliged to talk to them. But now I feel part of the society and it seems that we have integrated so much and that our culture is so similar there is no need for a community to develop. You might see a couple of Scots here and there but I haven't seen any major sort of community form.'*

*'It's probably xenophobic but there is certainly a strong link between the Scots and the Irish. The Scots and the Irish have a little bit of antagonism towards the English and it usually comes in handy to mark yourself out as Scottish rather than English in case anyone gets confused. Because of the proximity of Ireland to Scotland and their kind of shared history, it does seem to be a deeper relationship here.'*

*'There is the connections between Ireland and Scotland, Celtic connections, so you are thought of as being one of them. We kind of have a shared culture, a similar sort of history so you can sort of blend in. I don't really think there is any such a thing as a Scottish community in Dublin. Apart from my boss I haven't really met anyone else who is Scottish and all my friends are Irish. I think because the cultures are so similar we blend in.'*

*'I've only met 2 or 3 Scottish people in my four years here. Yeah, maybe at the rugby weekend or something. Even in Temple Bar, you hardly hear a Scottish accent. There is no obvious Scottish community at all. I think sometimes when you are abroad Scottish people might swap phone numbers and go for a drink, but here everybody is so alike to the Scots there is really no need for it. Everybody is very similar to the Scots.'*

*'I've only ever been to one St Andrews night and one Burns night and there was never anything organised. In other places, if there was an old firm match a lot of Scots would turn out for that and there would be a distinctive community and then you would sort of blend back into the background again. Whereas the Irish community, I've been to the Caymen Islands and there is a strong Irish community. Maybe the Scottish community isn't so easily defined and you just naturally blend in and go with the flow. We are both refugees here but we have good jobs and are not a threat to the Irish people. I've never had any sort of abuse from anybody coming up and asking me why I am here and taking jobs from an Irish person. I have known plenty of coloured people receiving abuse on the streets. I don't know, I suppose the Irish have lots of experience of Scottish people. If you asked 99% of them if they knew any Scottish people they would say yes. Maybe that's the problem; they do not know the other cultures. I think it's to do with the sense of humour too. The Irish and Scots can share a joke, and have a pint together whereas an Irish and Nigerian probably cannot.'*

---

Arguably then, it is the importance of Dublin's open and tolerant attitude to the Scots rather than the general and somewhat shallow cosmopolitan film that sits on the surface of the city that helps explain why Scots feel so at home in the city. Florida is correct in arguing that cities that are open to diversity are a source of attraction to creative talent. In Dublin, however, a more potent source of social inclusion would seem to stem from the openness of the Irish to Scottish people in particular. In other words, Dublin appeals to the Scots first and foremost because of its openness to them, rather than its openness to all cultures more generally.

The implications for Scottish policy makers would seem to be two fold.

- First, that when pitching Scottish cities to 'outsiders' it is important to be aware that the boundaries between who constitutes an 'insider' and an 'outsider' is more complex than first meets the eye. Different migrant streams might feel different degrees of historical and cultural association with Scotland and therefore there will be different experiences of openness and tolerance from the outset. Scotland de facto will be experienced as more or less cosmopolitan depending upon which migrant stream is being considered.
- Whilst the production of a kind of manicured cosmopolitan film on the surface of the city provides a welcome social milieu for skilled talent, it is even more crucial that the indigenous population are truly experienced as open and welcoming. Restaurants promising cultural curiosity, commodified cultural festivals, and an exotic night time economy are all important, but the ease with which people settle into a city and feel relaxed is primarily rooted in the sense that the indigenous population is genuinely at one with migrants.

**Research question 3 - To gain insight into the aspirations of expatriates, whether a return to Scotland is on their minds, and under what circumstances such a return might take place**

**Fright but not flight?**

Towards the end of each of the Focus Groups, participants were asked to reflect upon the problems that living in Dublin had created, whether these problems were of sufficient severity to merit leaving the country, and the circumstances under which a return to Scotland might be likely. Given that most of the participants could accurately be described as skilled transient migrants, there was a definite sense that for most, Dublin was not the last stop. There was, nonetheless, a general haziness about future plans and very few participants had a definite exit strategy. This vagueness represents both a constraint and an opportunity for those interested in luring back diasporeans. In reflecting upon these questions, initial attention was given to the **human capital** and the **cultural cosmopolitan** schools of thought, as it was believed that the exit from Dublin would be most contingent upon the state of the labour market and the party weariness of the expatriates.

At the time of writing (late 2004), Ireland's economic miracle looks to be on the wane. In the Irish state's own *Economic Review and Outlook* (published September 2002 – Government of Ireland, 2002), for instance, it was confirmed that the economy in 2002 was likely to be characterised by a GDP growth rate of 'only' 3.5 %, and GNP growth rate of 'only' 3 %. Moreover, it was suggested that given the then strengthening of the Euro relative to both Sterling and the Dollar, a tightening labour market giving way to a relatively poor inflation figure of 4.5 %, a growing reluctance of the private sector (led by the employers' federation IBEC) to enter into a new social partnership agreement, and the particular global problems faced by the Information and Communications Technology sector (ICT) that Ireland is so heavily reliant upon, a resumption of solid growth is by no way guaranteed. Such concerns have in turn resulted (autumn 2003 onwards) in a new wave of fiscal constraints which have been sold by the Irish state as reductions in public sector growth rather than cut backs as such.

For advocates of the human capital school, this kind of climate may prove to offer a fertile hunting ground for the *Fresh Talent Scotland Initiative*. Focus Group evidence suggests otherwise. To be sure, most of the participants did note that the economic slow down was a tangible reality that was beginning to be reflected on the ground. However, few suggested that the effects were sufficient to lead them to think twice about staying in Dublin for now. Dublin's economy might be slowing but the drying up of opportunities was evidently not seeping far enough into the psyche of the Scottish expatriate community to prompt them to consider their positions. Moreover, it was noted that even if jobs started to dry up, Scotland could not offer anything better. Whilst many participants noted that they would quite like to return to Scotland, they also added that the lack of career prospects made this impossible.

The demise of the Celtic Tiger : fright but not flight

*'I think the Celtic Tiger is dead now. When I first came over there was all the talk about the economic boom and the job opportunities that were created and I guess that is why I came over initially, as I heard about the IT opportunities. But I think it is slowing down. There isn't the same level of jobs. Ireland cannot rely on the same level of objective 1 funding as it did in the past so I think it will begin to struggle a bit.'*

*'Since I've been here Irish people have been talking about how long this will last and I think a lot of them have the attitude that it will last forever but I think even now it is starting to change. I don't think there will be a big crash or anything like that but the government are realising that they cannot expect the EU to keep bailing them out. I sound really pessimistic but I don't mean to. I just think that I came here at the tail end of something big and I've been lucky to have had this opportunity. But I don't think it is a long term thing.'*

*'We have started having redundancies, now that was unheard of in the last 7 years. There have been guys who have left university and who have never known anything but this wealth of jobs. Obviously coming from Scotland, we have been used to being knocked back and having to go to loads of job interviews. I think it has been a real shock to them. People are now falling from a great height and everyone is now looking over their shoulders.'*

> *'Well like I said, our company are making people redundant and everybody is looking over their shoulders and the project is shrinking a bit. Nobody is indispensable. But I think over the last couple of years you've become more aware of your position. The fact that really good engineers have been unemployed for 6 or 7 months shows you that if you do lose your job, there's a good chance you will be unemployed.'*
>
> *'The only reason I would move back to Scotland would be if they had more job opportunities. I think a lot of students graduate and then can't find a job anywhere. So they have to move on somewhere else. A lot of people end up in London, which is a common destination. And others will travel for a while. I think especially in the IT sector it tends to be lower skilled jobs in Scotland rather than programmers or consultants jobs, which are on offer here. The key is to have the jobs available but without them nobody is going to move back home. I mean Scotland has all the right ingredients in one sense – transport, NHS, relatively cheap cost of living, but it doesn't have the same opportunities for graduates.'*

Likewise, at the outset it was thought that whilst the Dublin cultural scene was attractive for expatriates, its appeal would eventually run out and 'burn out' and 'party fatigue' would set in. Certainly, many of the older participants did note that they were beginning to feel the pace of life and the vibrancy of Dublin tiring and were searching for a more sedate style of life. Those participants who were planning to raise a family noted that perhaps Dublin wasn't the best environment to bring kids up in and that Scotland might offer more in this regard. These points made however, there was no sense that the shine had come off Dublin and that the sense of excitement about living in a vibrant and colourful city was turning into cultural fatigue syndrome.

> Dublin's ambience and the life cycle
>
> *'I feel Dublin is a young persons city, its all right for a couple of years to get some work experience and to meet interesting people but its hard to settle down in. I think especially if we had children then we might want them to be brought up in Scotland as I think it has more to offer them than here – good education system, free healthcare etc. I think the quality of life for families is better.'*
>
> *'For me, I really enjoy the social life here and the music scene so I think I have a different attitude in some respects. If I was wanting to settle down here then I think I would really question what sort of life I could afford to have. Dublin is a vibrant city but it is getting more and more expensive to live in and the salaries are not increasing to reflect that. I think my friends see it as one long weekend and are attracted by the social life here. The reality is a bit different. And I think after 1 or 2 years the novelty would wear off and you would start to get itchy feet. But it depends upon what stage in life you are at. I think it's mainly a great place for students to come over and experience.'*

### Dublin – Literal and indirect costs to quality of life

The Achilles Heel for Dublin then, is neither the drying up of opportunities nor the diminishing appeal of the party city to a maturing expatriate community. Instead, inspection of the Focus Group data would seem to point to the importance of social **quality of life** factors or the more traditional aspects of the soft infrastructure of the city. Here, Scotland is widely perceived to trump Dublin and by some distance. In fact, it is Dublin's diminishing ability to offer the more orthodox quality of life supports that is leading many Scots to genuinely question whether they have a long term future in the city. Two types of quality of life supports in particular merit attention; the 'costs' of living in the city, and the absence of family and friends.

The cost of living in Dublin emerged as a major source of frustration for expatriates.
These costs were both literal (the expensive) and indirect (the inefficiency and weaknesses of the public services, particularly transport and health). As one participant put it; *My friends at home, they made a brilliant point, maybe by saying two or three years ago – oh Dublin is brilliant. Now they are saying, oh Dublin is really expensive'*.The felt experience of living in Dublin is slowly metamorphosing from bohemian warmth into frustration about being ripped off. Among the many sources of complaint that were repeatedly brought up in Focus Groups were the cost of health care and the workings of the heath care system, traffic congestion and the cost of insuring and taxing a car, the cost of housing, and the general cost of living on a day to day basis. Scotland was consistently referred to as offering a far better quality of life than Dublin in these areas.

> Dublin – a city with a declining quality of life
>
> *'The NHS in the UK has a bad reputation but it is a beacon of light compared to what you can expect here. To go and see a GP will cost you 40-50 Euros. And if you get a prescription saying you need medicines that costs a 100 Euros a week, you need to pay that or you will not get the medicines.'*
>
> *'You only get 2 sick days, I thought it was two days per week but it turned out to be only 2 days per year. Then you have to apply to the government and unless you have worked here for 2-3 years you cannot claim sick pay cause your PSRI from here, they work it over three years.  Same if you are unemployed now, if you have only been working for a year, then you won't be entitled to unemployment benefit. So I think that in some ways the Celtic Tiger is terrible!'*

> *'It's really hard to settle down because of the house prices. The cost of living is huge. When you go back home you notice everything is cheaper. I mean I love it here and I'd really like to stay but I cannot get a foothold in the housing market. If I was earning the same wage in Scotland I could have bought a flat 4 years ago in Glasgow or Edinburgh. Then at least you could start settling down and have a better quality of life but here you know, you can only see 6 months ahead. There is no way I am going to pay 320 K for a house that might only be worth 80 K. When the backside falls out of the economy you are going to be in trouble. This makes you really unsettled as the economy isn't growing anymore and the house prices are extortionate. If there were cheaper houses I would have settled here quite happily but also if you look at the Euro, my mate bought a property for 300K – If he had bought that in Spain it would have been a mansion. I ain't paying 300 K for a shed.'*
>
> *'I stay with my friend just now and our rent was 1300 Euro a month. Now I'm trying to find myself a one bedroomed flat somewhere decent. I went to this place – one bedroomed flat and it was 800 Euro a month which is a lot money and it was a decent area but when I went in the smell was terrible and the grout in the shower was black the toilet was disgusting. The room was three times the size of this table (pointing to a desk size table). And it had a single bed in one corner, a two-ring cooker in the other and a falling down wardrobe in the other. When I came out there were 10 people waiting to go and see it.'*
>
> *'I have a friend at work who is on her fourth car loan and she doesn't even have a car. You are simply borrowing to live.'*
>
> *'It's very difficult to own your own property here. To get a mortgage, most places want a 20% deposit, some will take a 10% deposit but not all of them will do. I mean in Scotland you can get a 100% mortgage or more. Here you have to save and save and even buying milk and the basics from the supermarkets you notice a difference in price. Little things can cost a lot more. You know even drink is expensive. You could spend 10 Euro for things here that would only cost 5 Euro back home. It is an expensive place to live in day to day.'*
>
> *'It costs 40 Euros just to visit the doctors. And you don't want to take the risk with your children so you have to pay it. I think you can get some free prescriptions but there is a cut off point – I think if you spend more than 80 Euro it is free after that. So from a family point of view, it can be very expensive. I think the general cost of living here is very high. You know car insurance back home costs between £200 and £400 a month. It is around £1500 here. Road tax in the UK is about £250 but here you can easily pay up to £1000. A comparison can also be made with the West End of Glasgow. You could share a flat just off Byres road say for around £275 a month. Here you would probably pay up to £400 for the same flat. I don't think salaries are keeping up with the heavy cost of living. In my hotel, two middle managers even living together would find it very difficult to buy a house. It could take up to two hours to travel to work from an area outside Dublin they could afford.'*
>
> *'Luckily I haven't had to use the health service here before. The dentist and the doctors all cost you money. People back home go on about the health service but you want to see the health service here. The traffic is the worst thing. That is the one thing that really spoils my quality of life here. If I mis-time the rush hour traffic it sometimes takes me one hour 45 minutes to get home. The whole infrastructure is abysmal. Back home you have the rail network between Glasgow and Edinburgh, and the M9 and M8. Dublin doesn't even have a rail network, and you know the M50 isn't even finished yet, There is a toll bridge right in the middle of it which also jams things right up. This LUAS (a light railway) tramway thing they are building its basically not going to do half of the things it's supposed to do. The transport situation in Scotland is so much better than here.'*
>
> *'When I first looked into insuring my car, it was going to cost about 1500 Euro to register it. My insurance back home was £400. Here I was quoted 3500 Euro, 2800 Euro it was like that. The tax is expensive too. The result is that I've just left my car back in the UK and simply cannot afford to buy one here.'*

The importance of non-substitutable family relationships and friendships represents another facet of Scotland's quality of life that was thought to be important in influencing future location decisions. Many of the participants noted that whilst they were not homesick, they did get people sick. This was most manifest when people were feeling vulnerable in Dublin (especially through illness), when people reflected on the mortality of their parents, and when they considered the importance of kin relations when bringing up children. The emotional attachment to family and friends back in Scotland represents a major lever for those interested in encouraging expatriates to return

## Conclusions and recommendations

Scotland and the lure of the family

*'I recently had an operation here and it really hit it home to me. I think being far away from my family at that difficult time was not easy. I'm quite family focused, so I would probably like some roots in Scotland. I think if my family wasn't such a factor, I wouldn't be that fixed on staying in Scotland.'*

*'One of the girls in our hotel is Irish and she went to work over in Edinburgh for a year and said it is just like being at home without your friends and your family, That probably describes my situation here. I simply don't have the same friends and family here, I think home will always be your home and it will always be like that.'*

*'I don't get homesick for Scotland at all – I get people sick I suppose as I miss my mum and my gran and my pals. But I suppose that is all part of growing up. I think it would have to take something huge to attract me back. Maybe If my mum got ill I would consider it.'*

*'I think I probably would go back; it depends on your family. I've got a really close family and if they are going to be there when I'm older I'd maybe go back and want to be with them. I'm talking about once I'm retired like. It's hard to deny the pull of brothers and sisters.'*

Against the backdrop of growing policy interest in using in-migration to **firstly** compensate for Scotland's falling fertility levels, ageing population structure and resultant growth in skill shortages, and **secondly** attract to Scotland an increased quota of members of the global creative class, the *Fresh Talent Scotland Initiative* looks set to grow in importance in 2004. With a view to contributing research of pertinence to this initiative, the purpose of this project has been to gain insights which might be of assistance to any agenda that seeks to stem out-migration, and if unsuccessful to lure Scottish diasporeans back to their homeland. Using the 'live' example of the new and growing Scottish expatriate community in Dublin as a case study, this project has sought to generate an understanding of why talent is leaving Scotland for Dublin, how Scots are finding Dublin as a place to live and work and what Scottish policy makers might learn from Dublin, and the factors that might encourage expatriates to return to Scotland. The results of ten Focus Groups conducted with expatriates in Dublin during the summer of 2003 have therein been presented.

In examining the flow of migrants from Scotland to Dublin, attention has been given to the analytic utility of the three main approaches which have come to dominate migration research; the **human capital**, social **quality of life**, and **cultural cosmopolitanism** schools of thought. Although clearly an over-simplification, a useful thumbnail sketch of our conclusions would be that whilst the human capital tradition (with its emphases on hard career opportunities) best explains the reason so many Scots are moving to Dublin, the cultural cosmopolitanism tradition (with its emphases on the importance of the cosmopolitan and festive ambience of a (work) place) help account for why diasporeans stick with Dublin and settle in effectively. Moreover, to the extent that the Scottish Executive might be able to play a role on repatriating diasporeans, it would seem that growing disenchantment with the social quality of life on offer in Dublin and an ingrained belief that Scotland boasts a superior social quality of life would appear to be key. In other words, the three broad traditions of migration research each have relevance to the case of Scottish expatriates in Dublin, but their relevance depends upon the stage in the migration process one is looking at. This conclusion is crucial we contend, in framing possibly policy responses.

In concluding it is useful to revisit the three principal research questions and to specify a number of recommendations which might of relevance to the Scottish Executive under each.

**To seek to understand the reasons why an increasing number of Scots are choosing to live and work in the Celtic Tiger and in particular Dublin.**

Whilst the Focus Groups did point to the existence of a number of 'tumbleweeds' that did factor Dublin's cosmopolitan ambience and status on the backpackers' global circuit more centrally in their location decisions, the principal conclusion to derive from the Focus Groups was that Dublin's rapid economic growth, surfeit of trans-national corporations, and surplus of employment and outstanding career opportunities must be regarded as the key reason why Scottish people are choosing to move there. In contrast, Scotland was widely perceived to be limited in its ability to allow talented people to fully realise their career ambitions. Moreover, a part cause and part consequence of the city's formidable economic growth, Dublin would seem to have evolved a dense army of public and private sector agencies which have creatively and vigorously embraced all the main methodologies of international recruitment.

In some regards, this conclusion makes for a depressing result as it suggests that Scotland might find it difficult to retain and attract people in the absence of hard economic opportunities. Florida's (2002a) belief, for instance, that the creative classes might be attracted by nurturing a national, regional or local culture shift which embraces cosmopolitanism, and that this in turn will create new jobs, seems chronologically debateable. The economy comes first, talent second, and a cosmopolitan milieu third. Consequently, the *Fresh Talent Scotland Initiative* might wish to:

1. *Continue to work alongside and feed off traditional forms of economic policy intervention. The economy comes first and people follow; not vice versa. Policy makers need to highlight in their pitch the manner in which Scotland's ageing*

*population structure is serving to generate a huge replacement demand in the labour market which might be freeing up senior posts thereby lubricating the ascent of ambitious talent.*

2. *Examine and appropriate the structures and methodologies of international promotion and recruitment that the full range of public and private agencies in Dublin have created and exploited.*

**To explore the experiences of Scottish expatriates in Dublin both at work and at play.**

Whilst not the decisive factor in the initial location decision of migrants, Dublin's youthful, cosmopolitan, and European feel, allied to its creative and flexible working practices, does serve to wed incomers to the city and reinforces feelings that they have made the correct choice. The aura and ambience of the Dublin workplace and the city more generally is important in so far as it helps to encourage skilled transient migrants to rest there a little longer. Our research endorses the view that at least for this small constituency, an exposure to another culture has brought a heightened awareness to many creative Scots that Scottish culture can at times be parochial, cynical, and sterile. Scotland can learn lessons from Dublin in relation to the cultural dispositions that underpin and enhance economic growth. Consequently, the Fresh Talent Initiative might wish to consider;

3. *Working with companies to promote the dismantling of rigid, bureaucratic, stifling, and conservative working practices and company hierarchies, and to create more enriching working practices which facilitate a flourishing of the employee by rewarding flexibility, creativity, lateral thinking, and openness. Rooted as these are in Scotland's long industrial heritage, clearly this requires a major culture shift in Scottish working practices and attitudes. This is a long term overhaul that will need sustained effort on behalf of a raft of public and private sector players.*

4. *Skilled talent does enjoy what has been referred to above as manicured cosmopolitanism – social mixing that revolves around the night-time economy and which is driven by consumption and leisure experiences. However, it will be the broader attitude of Scottish people that will be most important. It must be recognised that Scotland will be experienced de facto as a differentially open and tolerant nation depending upon the history and culture of the migration stream being considered. More research is required to see how the boundaries between 'insider' and 'outsider' are differentially constructed for different migrant streams. Therein there will be a need to continue to oppose racism in all its forms and to combine policies which promote real political cosmopolitanism alongside the more shallow and manicured variants of cosmopolitanism enjoyed by some expatriates. A feeling of being at home in a city would seem to derive more from the perception of being at one with the domestic population than from the sampling of the multi-cultural frivolities of the downtown leisure economy.*

**To gain insight into the aspirations of expatriates, whether a return to Scotland is on their minds, and under what circumstances such a return might take place**

Neither Dublin's faltering economy, nor party weariness, would seem to be opening opportunities for the *Fresh Talent Scotland Initiative* to lure back diasporeans. Being skilled transient migrants, there was no sense that Dublin was a final place of rest, but that the future location decisions of expatriates were ill defined and hazy. Given the non-existence of a strong Scottish diasporic community and the limited sense of interest in Scottish nationalism, pulling the patriotic heart strings too would not appear a particularly productive way to progress. To the extent that policy intervention might usefully structure the horizons of expatriates in favour of Scotland, it would seem that the comparative superiority of the social quality of life on offer in Scotland provides the greatest leverage. In making their pitch to diasporeans then, the *Fresh Talent Scotland Initiative* should;

5. *Emphasise the reasonable cost of living and strong infrastructure in Scotland as compared to many other countries, paying particular attention to the pitfalls of countries with unaffordable house prices, expensive health care systems, frustrating transport congestion, and a generally high cost of living.*

6. *Examine the ways in which packages might be made to returnees to assist their reintegration into Scotland which play on the salience of social quality of life issues. For instance, a one stop agency might serve to alleviate the administration and cost burdens of moving house, reviewing potential school catchments, restoring dental and health care rights, and registering vehicles for road tax etc.*

7. *Highlight the importance family and friendships especially in times of need and the shallowness of relationships in exile.*

# REFERENCES

Allen K (2000) *The Celtic Tiger: The myth of social partnership in Ireland* (Manchester University Press, Manchester)

Alexander W (2003) *Chasing the Tartan Tiger: lessons from a Celtic cousin* (The Smith Institute, London)

Beck U (2002) 'The cosmopolitan society and its enemies' *Theory, culture and society* 19 17-44

Boyle P, Halfacree K and Robinson P (1999) *Exploring contemporary migration* (Longman, London)

Central Statistics Office (2002a) *Census 2002 Preliminary Report* (CSO, Dublin)

Central Statistics Office (2002b) *Population and Migration Estimates* (CSO, Dublin)

Clinch P, Convery F and Walsh B (2002) *After the Celtic Tiger: Challenges Ahead* (The O'Brien Press, Dublin)

Craig C (2003) *The Scots crises of confidence* (Big Thinking, Edinburgh)

FAS (2003) *Irish labour market review, 2002* (FAS, Dublin)

Findlay A (2002) *From brain exchange to brain gain: Policy implications for the UK of recent trends in skilled migration from developing countries* (International migration papers series 46 ILO, Geneva)

Florida R (2002a) *The rise of the creative class* (Basic Books, NY)

Florida R (2002b) 'The rise of the creative class' *Washington Monthly*, May 1-5.

Futureskills Scotland (2002a) *The Scottish labour market 2002* (Scottish Enterprise, Glasgow)

Futureskills Scotland (2002b) *Skills in Scotland: The employers' view* (Scottish Enterprise, Glasgow)

Futureskills Scotland (2003) *Skills in Scotland 2003* (Scottish Enterprise, Glasgow)

Government of Ireland (2002) *Economic Review and Outlook* (Government of Ireland, Dublin)

Harrison R and Mason C (2003) 'Richard Florida's work and the attraction of talent to Scotland' Regional Studies Seminar, November 2003.

Insider (2002) 'McConnell to urge Directors to reverse brain drain' *Insider: Scotland's national business magazine* Sept 10th 2002.

Kirkpatrick P (2003) 'Skill expatriation: Lessons learned from the Celtic Tiger for Scotland's turnaround' (Unpublished paper, available from authors)

Krugman P (2003) 'Eye of the Tiger' *Sunday Business Herald* 2/11/03

Levie J, Brown, W and Galloway L (2002) *Global entrepreneurship monitor: Scotland 2002* (Hunter Institute, University of Strathclyde)

Millington S and Young C (2003) 'Producing the 'cosmopolitan city. Cosmopolitanism and urban regeneration in Dublin, Republic of Ireland' *Association of American Geographers Conference* March 2003. New Orleans.

McSharry R and White P (2000) *The making of the Celtic Tiger: The inside story of Ireland's boom economy* (Mercier Press, Dublin)

O'Hearn D (2001) *The Atlantic economy: Britain, The US and Ireland* (Manchester University Press, Manchester)

Price Waterhouse Coopers (2003) *An insight into Scottish entrepreneurialism* (Price Waterhouse Coopers, Glasgow)

Randall J (2002) Scotland's Population: Current trends and future prospects (GROS, Edinburgh)

Scottish Enterprise (2003) 'Scotland's attractiveness to Talent' EPRC Seminar May 2003.

Travers J J (2001) *Driving the Tiger: Irish Enterprise Spirit* (Gill and MacMillan, London)

## Table 1a  Forecast expansion and replacement demand by sector, Scotland 2001-2006

| SECTOR | REPLACEMENT DEMAND | EXPANSION DEMAND |
|---|---|---|
| Public admin and defence | 27,000 | -3,000 |
| Health and education | 66,000 | 19,000 |
| Other services | 27,000 | 9,000 |
| Professional services | 28,000 | 22,000 |
| Banking, business services | 43,000 | 28,000 |
| Transport and communication | 29,000 | -3,000 |
| Distribution, hotels etc | 105,000 | -8,000 |
| Construction | 41,000 | -7,000 |
| Utilities | 3,000 | -1,000 |
| Other manufacturing | 12,000 | -1,000 |
| Engineering | 30,000 | -18,000 |
| Metals, mineral products | 3,000 | -2,000 |
| Chemicals | 7,000 | -1,000 |
| Textiles and clothing | 6,000 | -7,000 |
| Food, drink and tobacco | 11,000 | -5,000 |
| Mining etc | 6,000 | -2,000 |
| Agriculture | 13,000 | -3,000 |

(Source: Futureskills Scotland 2002a)

## Table 1b - Forecast expansion and replacement demand by occupation, Scotland 2001-2006

| OCCUPATION | REPLACEMENT DEMAND | EXPANSION DEMAND |
|---|---|---|
| Elementary:Clerical/Service | 40,000 | 9,000 |
| Elementary:Trades/Plant/Machine | 43,000 | -4,000 |
| Transport Drivers & Operatives | 28,000 | -4,000 |
| Process Plant & Machine Operatives | 18,000 | -5,000 |
| Customer Service Occupation | -16,000 | 0 |
| Sales Occupation | 9,000 | 0 |
| Leisure/Other Personal Service Occupation | -6,000 | -3,000 |
| Caring Personal Service Occupation | -11,000 | 8,000 |
| Other Skilled Trades | 17,000 | -2,000 |
| Skilled Construction Trades | 18,000 | -4,000 |
| Skilled Metal/Electrical Trades | 25,000 | -11,000 |
| Skilled Agricultural Trades | 8,000 | -3,000 |
| Secretarial & Related Occupation | 10,000 | -2,000 |
| Admin & Clerical Occupation | 42,000 | 7,000 |
| Business/Public Service Professionals | 46,000 | 5,000 |
| Culture/Media/Sport Occupation | 18,000 | 4,000 |
| Protective Service Occupation | 9,000 | 1,000 |
| Health Assoc Professionals | 27,000 | 6,000 |
| Science Assoc Professionals | 12,000 | -1,000 |
| Business/Public Service Professionals | 8,000 | 3,000 |
| Teaching/Research Professionals | 15,000 | 14,000 |
| Health Professionals | 4,000 | 3,000 |
| Science/Tech Professionals | 29,000 | 6,000 |
| Managers & Proprietors | 23,000 | -9,000 |
| Corporate Managers | 40,000 | -3,000 |

(Source : Futureskills Scotland 2002a)

**Table 2: Persons usually resident in the Republic of Ireland and present on census night classified by place of birth 2002.**

| Birthplace | Number |
|---|---|
| **Total** | **3 858 495** |
| Republic of Ireland | 3 458 479 |
| **Outside Ireland** | **400 016** |
| EU | 281 316 |
| England and Wales | 182 624 |
| Northern Ireland | 49 928 |
| **Scotland** | **15 963** |
| Eastern Europe | 26 235 |
| America | 29 119 |
| Asia | 28 132 |
| Africa | 26 515 |
| Australia and New Zealand | 8 363 |

(Central Statistics Office, 2002a)

## Table 3 Summary breakdown of the Focus Group Participants

| Question | % Breakdowns |
|---|---|
| 1. Age | **29%** aged between 18-25, **61%** aged between 26-35, **8%** aged between 36 and 45, and **3%** aged between 46 and 55. |
| 2. Gender | **74%** Men, **26%** Women |
| 3. Origins in Scotland | **29%** Central Belt, **16%** Ayrshire, **16%** Glasgow, **13%** Edinburgh, **8%** Borders, **8%** Fife, **5%** Inverness, **3%** Dumfries and Galloway. |
| 4. Irish roots in the family | **55%** No Irish roots, **45%** Yes to Irish roots. Of those that said yes **6%** were first generation, **41%** were second generation, **35%** third generation, and **20%** fourth generation. |
| 5. Marital Status | **79%** Single, **18%** Married, **5%**, **3%** divorced |
| 6. Salary | **18%** earned 15-25,000 Euro, **26%** earned between 25-30,000 Euro, **16%** earned 30-35,000 Euro, **5%** earned 35-40,000 Euro, **8%** 40-45,000 Euro, **13%** earned 45-55,000 Euro, **8%** earned 70, 000 + Euro |
| 7. Occupation | **13%** Managers or Senior Professionals, **37%** Middle Managers or Professional or high skilled employees, **32%** were Associate Professional or skilled manual, **18%** skilled non manual service sector employees. |
| 8. Sector | **29%** in ICT, **18%** in Accountancy and Finance, **18%** in Hotel and Catering, **5%** in Construction, **8%** Utilities (Telecommunications), **5%** Engineering **8%** in Health/Welfare, and **8%** in Retailing |
| 7. Date of migration to Dublin | **5%** 2003, **13%** 2002, **26%** 2001, **32%** 2000, **5%** 1999, **8%** 1998, **11 %** pre 1998. |
| 8.Length of time in present Job | **13%** under 1 year, **72%** 1-3years, **16%** 3- 5 years. |
| 9. No. of jobs since migration | **47%** have had 1 job, **23%** 2 jobs, **6%** 3 jobs, **18%** have had 4 jobs, **5%** have 5 + jobs. |
| 10 Tenure | **73%** Rent, **23%** owner/occupier, **3%** other. |

NB: The total number of participants is 38 and only the key % are indicated

## Appendix 1 - Details of the organisation of the Focus Groups

| Date of Focus Group | Location/Time | Economic Sector(s) Represented | Participants who attended [No.recruited for the group] |
|---|---|---|---|
| 6th May 2003 | Trinity College Dublin; Geography Practical Room 6.30pm-8.00pm | Information and Communications Technology (ICT) | 5 [6] |
| 7th May 2003 | Trinity College Dublin; Geography Practical Room 6.30pm-8.00pm | Accountancy and Finance | 2 [3] |
| 19th May 2003 | Trinity College Dublin; Geography Practical Room 6.30pm-8.00pm | Hotel and Catering (H/C) and Construction | 6 [6] |
| 20th May 2003 | Trinity College Dublin; Geography Practical Room 6.30pm-8.00pm | Finance and Utilities | 2 [4] |
| 4th June 2003 | Trinity College Dublin; Geography Practical Room 6.30pm-8.00pm | ICT, Finance Health/Social | 6 [6] |
| 1st July 2003 | Isaacs Hotel, Conference Room 6.30pm-8.20pm | H/C [+1], ICT [+1], Misc.[+1] | 3 [4] |
| 2nd July 2003 | Isaacs Hotel, Conference Room 6.30pm-8.00pm | ICT, Construction Utilities, H/C. | 5 [5] |
| 21st July 2003 | Isaacs Hotel, Conference Room 6.30pm-7.30pm | ICT, Misc | 2 [2] |
| 22nd July 2003 | Isaacs Hotel, Conference Room 6.30pm-8.00pm | Accountancy and Finance, Misc | 3 [3] |
| 21st August 2003 | Isaacs Hotel, Conference Room 5.45pm-7.10pm | Accountancy and Finance | 4 [4] |

# Appendix 2  Key background information on the Focus Group Participants

| No. | Age | Gend. | Origins in Scotland | Irish Roots | Marital Status | Salary (Euro '000 K) | Occ. | Sector | Date of Migr. | Length of Time in yrs in Job | Number of Jobs since Migrating | Tenure |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1 | 18-25 | F | Borders | No | Single | 25-30 | 3 | Utilities (Tel) | 2000 | 1-3 | 3 | Rent |
| 2 | 18-25 | M | Edinburgh | No | Single | 25-30 | 2 | ICT | 2002 | 1-3 | 1 | Rent |
| 3 | 36-45 | M | Glasgow | No | Divorced | 80 + | 1 | ICT | 2000 | 1-3 | 1 | O/O |
| 4 | 26-35 | M | Central Belt | No | Single | 50-55 | 2 | ICT | 2000 | 1-3 | 1 | Rent |
| 5 | 26-35 | M | Fife | 2nd Generation | Single | No Response | 2 | ICT | 1999 | 3-5 | 1 | Rent |
| 6 | 18-25 | F | Borders | No | Single | 25-30 | 2 | Acc. and Fin. | 2000 | 1-3 | 2 | Rent |
| 7 | 18-25 | M | Central Belt | 3rd Generation | Single | 50-55 | 2 | Acc. and Fin | 2000 | 1-3 | 1 | Rent |
| 8 | 18-25 | M | Edinburgh | 2nd Generation | Single | 25-30 | 4 | Hot. and Cat. | 2001 | 1-3 | 4 | Rent |
| 9 | 36-45 | M | Inverness | No | Married | 80 + | 1 | Hot. and Cat. | 1990 | 3-5 | 4 | O/O |
| 10 | 18-25 | M | Edinburgh | 1st Generation | Single | 15-25 | 4 | Hot. And Cat. | 2001 | 1-3 | 4 | Rent |
| 11 | 26-35 | M | Glasgow | No | Single | 35-40 | 3 | Hot. And Cat | 2001 | 1-3 | 1 | Rent |
| 12 | 26-35 | F | Dumfries & Gallow | No | Single | 15-25 | 3 | Hot. and Cat. | 2001 | 3-5 | 1 | Rent |
| 13 | 26-35 | M | Edinburgh | No | Single | 30-35 | 2 | Construction | 2000 | 1-3 | 1 | Rent |
| 14 | 26-35 | M | Glasgow | No | Co-habiting | 40-45 | 3 | Utilities (Tel) | 2002 | 1-3 | 2 | O/O |
| 15 | 26-35 | M | Central Belt | 4th Generation | Married | 70-80 | 1 | Acc. and Fin. | 2002 | 1-3 | 1 | O/O |
| 16 | 18-25 | F | Borders | No | Single | 25-30 | 3 | Health and Wel. | 2000 | 1-3 | 2 | Rent |
| 17 | 26-35 | M | Central Belt | No | Single | No Response | 2 | ICT | 2001 | 1-3 | 1 | O/O |
| 18 | 26-35 | M | Glasgow | 3rd Generation | Married | 30-35 | 2 | ICT | 2001 | 1-3 | 1 | Rent |
| 19 | 36-45 | M | Central Belt | No | Married | 30-35 | 2 | ICT | 1998 | <1 | 4 | Rent |
| 20 | 46-55 | M | Glasgow | 2nd Generation | Married | 50-55 | 2 | Health and Wel. | 1979 | 1-3 | 5 | O/O |
| 21 | 26-35 | M | Central Belt | 2nd Generation | Married | 40-45 | 2 | Health and Wel. | 1994 | 1-3 | 4 | Other |
| 22 | 26-35 | F | Central Belt | 2nd Generation | Single | 25-30 | 1 | Hot and Cat. | 1995 | 1-3 | 4 | O/O |
| 23 | 26-35 | M | Ayrshire | 3rd Generation | Single | 25-30 | 3 | Construction | 2001 | 1-3 | 1 | Rent |
| 24 | 26-35 | M | Central Belt | 3rd Generation | Single | 30-35 | 2 | ICT | 2001 | 1-3 | 1 | Rent |
| 25 | 26-35 | F | Edinburgh | 3rd Generation | Single | 30-35 | 3 | Engineering | 1998 | 3-5 | 30 | Rent |
| 26 | 18-25 | M | Ayrshire | 3rd Generation | Single | 30-35 | 1 | Hot. and Cat. | 2002 | 1-3 | 1 | Rent |
| 27 | 18-25 | F | Central Belt | 2nd Generation | Single | 25-30 | 4 | Utilities (Tel) | 2002 | 1-3 | 2 | Rent |
| 28 | 26-35 | M | Fife | No | Single | 40-45 | 4 | ICT | 1998 | 3-5 | 1 | O/O |
| 29 | 26-35 | M | Fife | No | Single | 45-50 | 3 | Engineering | 2000 | <1 | 4 | Rent |
| 30 | 26-35 | M | Central Belt | No | Single | 15-25 | 3 | ICT | 1999 | 1-3 | 1 | Rent |

Mark Boyle and Suzanne Motherwell

| | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 31 | 18-25 | M | Edinburgh | No | Single | 15-25 | 4 | Retail | 2001 | <1 | 2 | Rent |
| 32 | 26-35 | M | Central Belt | 2nd Generation | Single | 35-40 | 2 | Acc. and Fin. | 2001 | 1-3 | 2 | O/O |
| 33 | 26-35 | M | Glasgow | No | Single | 15-25 | 4 | Retail | 2000 | 1-3 | 2 | Rent |
| 34 | 26-35 | M | Inverness | No | Single | 15-25 | 4 | Retail | 2000 | 1-3 | 2 | Rent |
| 35 | 26-35 | F | Ayrshire | No | Married | 25-30 | 3 | Acc and Fin. | 2000 | 1-3 | 2 | Rent |
| 36 | 26-35 | F | Ayrshire | No | Single | 25-30 | 3 | Acc. and Fin. | 2000 | <1 | 3 | Rent |
| 37 | 26-35 | M | Ayrshire | 4th Generation | Co-habiting | No Response | 2 | ICT | 2003 | 3-5 | 1 | Rent |
| 38 | 18-25 | F | Ayrshire | 4th Generation | Single | 15-25 | 3 | Acc. and Fin | 2003 | <1 | 1 | Rent |

Note – Under Occupation 1 = Managers or senior professionals, 2 = Middle managers or professional or high skilled personnel, 3 = Associate professional or skilled manual, 4 = skilled non manual service sector employee

# Appendix 3  Topics covered in the Focus Groups

| Focus Group Topic | Prompting Questions |
| --- | --- |
| **a) To seek to understand the reasons why an increasing number of Scots are choosing to live and work in the Celtic Tiger and in particular Dublin.** | What attracted you to migrate to Dublin? What were your feelings towards Dublin as a place prior to your arrival? What knowledge did you have about career opportunities prior to your arrival ? How did you find out about possible employment opportunities? Were you attracted by the vibe or cosmopolitan image of Dublin? Was there anything in particular about Scotland or your previous place of abode that prompted you to leave? |
| **b) To explore the experiences of Scottish expatriates in Dublin both at work and at play.** . | What do you think international migrants bring to the city? Does Dublin rely on the expertise of international migrants? Do different international migrants contribute different things? Specifically, what do you think Scottish Migrants bring to Dublin (specific knowledge, skills, attitudes)? Is there a sense of community amongst Scottish migrants? Is it important to you to carve out a Scottish Identity amongst your friends and colleagues? Do you feel being in Dublin has deepened your sense of Scottishness? As a Scottish migrant, what do you feel you contribute personally and professionally? Have you made any changes in your workplace? Have you ever used the phrase Celtic Tiger and does it have any significance for you? In what ways do you think Scottish migrants have benefited from leaving Scotland? How has working and living in Dublin added to your personal and professional development? How has your career developed since being here? Have you been promoted or has your job changed while in Dublin? Do you think the buzz has changed? Has your quality of life been affected by moving to Dublin? Is it easy to buy or rent accommodation? What does the state offer in terms of Health Care and Pension Plans? Would you like to see any improvements? Do you have regular contact with work relations, family and friends still living in Scotland? How do you keep in touch? Email, Phone? What sort of information do you tell them? Would you recommend friends, family etc to come and work/live here? Do you think your friends/family get a false impression of Dublin? Are they impressed by the lifestyle you have in Dublin? |
| **c) To gain insight into the aspirations of expatriates, whether a return to Scotland is on their minds, and under what circumstances such a return might take place.** | Do you have any aspirations to move elsewhere? Do you feel Ireland is now feeling the pinch after 10 successful years of economic growth? – How has this affected you? If you are undecided about your next move, how do you move from this state to a decision? What factors might influence your decision? What channels would you use to move elsewhere? Would you like to return to Scotland? What would attract you to move there? What professional and personal reasons would make you return to Scotland? Finally, do you have any regrets about moving to Dublin? |